



U.S. Department of Justice

Office of the Solicitor General

The Solicitor General

Washington, D.C. 20530

February 20, 2025

The Honorable Charles Grassley
President Pro Tempore
United States Senate
Washington, DC 20510

Re: Multilayer Restrictions on the Removal of Administrative Law Judges

Dear Senator Grassley:

Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. 530D, I am writing to advise you that the Department of Justice has concluded that the multiple layers of removal restrictions for administrative law judges (ALJs) in 5 U.S.C. 1202(d) and 7521(a) violate the Constitution, that the Department will no longer defend them in court, and that the Department has taken that position in ongoing litigation. See 2/11/25 Letter, *Axalta Coating Systems LLC v. FAA*, No. 23-2376 (3d Cir.).

In *Free Enterprise Fund v. PCAOB*, 561 U.S. 477 (2010), the Supreme Court determined that granting “multilayer protection from removal” to executive officers “is contrary to Article II’s vesting of the executive power in the President.” *Id.* at 484. The President may not “be restricted in his ability to remove a principal [executive] officer, who is in turn restricted in his ability to remove an inferior [executive] officer.” *Ibid.*

A federal statute provides that a federal agency may remove an ALJ “only for good cause established and determined by the Merit Systems Protection Board on the record after opportunity for hearing before the Board.” 5 U.S.C. 7521(a). Another statute provides that a member of the Board “may be removed by the President only for inefficiency, neglect of duty, or malfeasance in office.” 5 U.S.C. 1202(d). Consistent with the Supreme Court’s decision in *Free Enterprise Fund*, the Department has determined that those statutory provisions violate Article II by restricting the President’s ability to remove principal executive officers, who are in turn restricted in their ability to remove inferior executive officers.

Please let me know if I can be of any further assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,

Sarah M. Harris
Acting Solicitor General